

THE LAW OF INFORMATION PRIVACY

CASES AND COMMENTARY

First Edition

Emilio Cividanes, esq.
and
Marc Rotenberg, esq.

Note: These materials have been prepared exclusively for the use of students at the Georgetown University Law Center during the fall 1991 semester. They may not be reproduced or used for any other purpose without permission of one of the editors.

Copyright © 1991 by Emilio Cividanes and Marc Rotenberg

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. THE RIGHT OF PRIVACY.....	1
A. THE AMERICAN TRADITION.....	1
1 The Warren and Brandeis Article.....	1
2. Subsequent Developments.....	11
a) New York Decision.....	11
b) The New York Civil Rights Law.....	15
c) The Modern View.....	16
d) Notes.....	19
B. COMPUTER PRIVACY.....	20
C. THE INTERNATIONAL VIEW.....	28
II. COMMON LAW ROOTS OF PRIVACY.....	45
A. HISTORICAL ROOTS.....	45
B. TORT LAW.....	46
2. Intrusion.....	46
a) Restatement (Second) of Torts 652B.....	46
b) Nader v. General Motors.....	46
3. Appropriation.....	50
a) Restatement (Second) Torts.....	50
b) Foster-Millburn Co. v. Chinn.....	50
c) Palmer v. Schonhorn Enterprises, Inc.....	51
d) Notes.....	54
4. Public Disclosure of Private Facts.....	55
a) Restatement (Second) Torts.....	55
b) Sidis v. F-R Pub. Corporation.....	55
5. False Light.....	58
a) Restatement (Second) Torts.....	58
b) Douglass v. Hustler Magazine.....	59
C. CONFIDENTIAL COMMUNICATIONS.....	65
1. Privileges.....	65
a) Introduction.....	65
b) The Attorney-Client Privilege.....	66
c) Physician-Patient Privilege.....	68
2. Liability for Breach of Duty of Confidentiality.....	70
a) Banks.....	70
b) Physicians.....	75
III. PRIVACY OVERVIEW — DUE PROCESS ROOTS.....	78
A. SEXUAL CONDUCT.....	78
1. Griswold v. Connecticut.....	78
B. CRIMINAL RECORDS.....	88
1. Paul v. Davis.....	88
C. MEDICAL RECORDS.....	97
1. Whalen v. New York.....	97
Notes.....	104
D. FINANCIAL RECORDS.....	105
1. Plante v. Gonzalez.....	105
E. JUVENILE RECORDS.....	113
1. J.P. v. DeSanti.....	113

IV. PRIVACY OVERVIEW — FOURTH AMENDMENT ROOTS	119
A. BANK RECORDS.....	119
UNITED STATES v. MILLER	119
COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA v. DeJOHN	127
DENONCOURT v. COMMONWEALTH OF PENNSYLVANIA.....	131
B. KATZ RECONSIDERED.....	135
1. Katz	135
Applications	135
ILLINOIS vs. WRIGHT	135
COHEN v. THE SUPERIOR COURT OF LOS ANGELES COUNTY.....	137
2. Katz	140
Implications.....	140
UNITED STATES v. KNOTTS.....	145
TEXAS v. BROWN.....	152
DOW CHEMICAL CO. v. UNITED STATES	152
V. PERSONAL RECORDS.....	162
A. PERSONAL RECORDS.....	162
1. The Mere Evidence Rule	162
2. Gouled v. United States.....	168
3. The Demise of the Mere Evidence Rule	173
4. Andresen v. Maryland.....	181
5. Doe v. United States.....	185
B. PRIVACY AND PERSONHOOD	191
1. Katz v. United States	191
C. THE IMPACT OF THE REALIST TRADITION.....	201
The Impact of American Legal Realism on the Constitutional Law of Privacy	201
VI. PRIVACY, THE FREE FLOW OF INFORMATION,	204
A. THE FREE FLOW OF INFORMATION	204
1. Privacy versus the First Amendment.....	204
a) False Statements.....	204
PHILADELPHIA NEWSPAPERS, INC. v. HEPPS	205
ii) Notes.....	211
iii) Nimmer, "The Right to Speak from Times to Time First Amendment Applied to Libel and Misapplied to Privacy," 56 Cal. L. Rev. 935, 958-967 (1968).....	212
iv) Note.....	216
b) Truthful Statements.....	216
THE FLORIDA STAR v. B. J. F.....	216
ii) Notes	222
2. The Freedom of Information Act.....	223
UNITED STATES DEPARTMENT OF JUSTICE v.....	223
b) Note.....	228
C) Ray v. Department of Justice	228
B. THE EXERCISE OF FUNDAMENTAL RIGHTS.....	232
1. Privacy and the First Amendment	232
NAACP v. ALABAMA.....	232
2. Other Fundamental Rights.....	234
THORNBURGH v. AMERICAN COLLEGE.....	234

VII. PERSONAL INFORMATION AND THIRD PARTY RECORDS.....	237
A. INTRODUCTION.....	237
A. Miller, "Personal Privacy in the Computer Age....."	237
B. FEDERAL GOVERNMENT RECORD-KEEPING	
THE PRIVACY ACT OF 1974.....	240
2. Case Law Development.....	245
a) McGregor v. Greer.....	245
b) Doe v. United States of America.....	247
c) Albright v. United States.....	252
C. PRIVATE SECTOR RECORD-KEEPING.....	257
1. Introduction.....	257
a) Sectoral Approach.....	257
b) Privacy Objectives.....	258
c) A Survey of Federal Laws.....	258
2. Consumer Credit Records.....	261
a) Hovater v. Equifax.....	261
b) Bryant v. TRW.....	265
c) Notes.....	269
3) Financial Records.....	270
a) Neece v. IRS.....	270
b) Duncan v. Belcher.....	274
4) Insurance and Medical Records.....	277
a) The Insurance Relationship.....	277
b) The Medical Care Relationship.....	280
c) Hague v. Williams.....	282
d) Notes.....	284
e) New York v. Newman.....	285
5) Cable Television Records.....	289
a) Subscriber Privacy Provision.....	289
b) Warner v. American Cablevision.....	291
c) Notes.....	298
E. MAILING LISTS.....	299
1. Transferring Names from List to List.....	299
a) How Does a Name Pass from List to List?.....	299
b) Whose Property Is It?.....	299
(i) Lamont v. Commissioner.....	300
(ii) Shibley v. Time.....	302
(iii) John Doe v. Registrar of Motor Vehicles.....	304
iv) Notes.....	310
2. Stemming the Flow of Mail.....	311
a) Constitutional Concerns.....	311
(i) Lamont v. Postmaster General.....	311
(ii) Rowan v. Post Office Department.....	313
VIII. PRIVACY OF COMMUNICATIONS.....	322
A. ROOTS OF PROTECTION.....	322
1. The Olmstead Dissent.....	322
2. State Tort Law.....	327
B. TITLE III.....	331
1. Federal Communication Act of 1934.....	331
2. Federal Wiretap Statute, Section 2511.....	334
3. Note.....	338
C. PREEMPTION.....	338

2(c)

Notes

1. Conklin.....	338
2. Vitello.....	344
D. PEN REGISTERS.....	361
1. Smith v. Maryland.....	361
2. Beauford.....	369
3. Melilli.....	376
4. Note.....	378
E. CALLER ID.....	379
1. The Pennsylvania Decision.....	379
2. The South Carolina Decision.....	394
IX. WORKPLACE PRIVACY	
COLLECTION OF PERSONAL DATA.....	400
A. PUBLIC SECTOR EMPLOYEES.....	400
1. O'Connor v. Ortega.....	400
B. DRUG TESTING.....	405
1. Introduction	
The Threat to Privacy Rights.....	405
2. The Supreme Court's View.....	411
a) Skinner v. Railway Labor Executives' Association.....	411
b) National Treasury Employees Union v. Raab.....	419
c) Notes.....	423
C. TELEPHONE MONITORING.....	425
1. One-Party Consent and the Business Extension Exemptio.....	425
a) Briggs v. American Air Filter.....	425
b) Watkins v. L. M. Barry.....	430
2. Recording of Telephone Conversations.....	436
3. Intersate Calls	
What Law Applies?.....	439
4. Legislation.....	444
X. PRIVACY OF IDENTITY.....	453
A. RIGHT OF ANONYMITY.....	453
1. Talley v. California.....	453
2. Hynes v. Borough of Oradell.....	457
3. Lamont v. Postmaster General.....	470
4. Notes.....	474
B. THE SOCIAL SECURITY NUMBER.....	474
1. Records, Computers, and the Rights of Citizens.....	474
2. Databanks in a Free Society.....	476
3. The Privacy Act SSN Provisions.....	477
a) The Statute.....	477
b) The Committee Report.....	478
4. Future Directions.....	478
XI. INTERNATIONAL PRIVACY LAW.....	483
A. EUROPEAN PRIVACY LAW.....	483
1. OECD Guidelines.....	483
2. Convention of the Council of Europe.....	489
3. The Data Protection Act of 1984 (England).....	495
4. Proposed Policy for Telecommunications Privacy.....	499
B. ASSESSMENT.....	501
1. Spencer: "1992 and All That".....	501
2. Flaherty: "Protecting Privacy".....	517

3. Cordell: "Privacy Some Solutions"541